Review Period 1

DOCUMENT BASED QUESTION

**Directions:** The following question is based on the accompanying Documents 1–5. This question is designed to test your ability to apply several historical-thinking skills simultaneously—i.e., contextualization, historical argumentation, and appropriate use of relevant historical evidence. Your response should be based on your analysis of the documents and your knowledge of the topic.

Write a well-integrated essay that does the following:

* States an appropriate thesis that directly addresses all parts of the question.
* Supports the thesis or an appropriate argument with evidence from all or all but one of the documents AND your knowledge of European history beyond/outside the documents.
* Analyzes a majority of the documents in terms of such features as their intended audience, purpose, point of view, format, argument, limitations, and/or social context as appropriate to the argument.
* Places the arguments in the context of broader, regional, national, or global processes.

**2. Evaluate how effective the Catholic Reformation was in responding to the division within Christianity.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Learning Objective** | **Main Historical Thinking Skills** | **Key Concepts in the** **Curriculum Framework** |
| **OS-2** Analyze how religious reform in the 16th and 17th centuries, the expansion of printing, and the emergence of civic venues such as salons and coffeehouses challenged the control of the church over the creation and dissemination of knowledge.**OS-11** Explain how and why religion increasingly shifted from a matter of public concern to one of private belief over the course of European history. | ContextualizationHistorical ArgumentationAppropriate Use of Relevant Historical Evidence | **1.3.I.C**  |

**ANSWER**

**Thesis**

Possible thesis statements could include the following:

* The Catholic Reformation responded effectively to the challenge presented by the divisions created by the Protestant Reformation.
* The Catholic Reformation managed only an ineffectual response to the Protestant Reformation without substantially altering the Catholic Church in response to this challenge.
* The Catholic Reformation succeeded in responding to some of the challenges raised by the Protestant Reformation but failed to sufficiently address other factors.

**Analysis of Documents**

To earn full credit for analysis of documents, responses must offer at least one of the following for *all* or *all but one* of the documents: intended audience, purpose, historical context, author’s point of view. The analyses must also support the stated thesis or a relevant argument.

**Document 1**

Source: Catholic Interrogation of Elizabeth Dirks, Protestant Dissenter Official**,** *What do you think of our mass?* (Elizabeth Dirks was an Anabaptist deaconess, who was tortured and eventually drowned in 1549 at the orders of the authorities in the town of Leeuwarden).

**Elizabeth:** My Lord, I have no faith in your mass but only in that which is the word of God.

**Official:** What do you think of the Holy Sacrament?

**Elizabeth:** I have never in my life read in Scripture about a Holy Sacrament, but only of the Supper of the Lord.

**Official:** Shut your mouth; you speak with a haughty tongue.

**Elizabeth:** No, my Lord, I speak with a free tongue.

**Official:** Do priests have the power to forgive sins?

**Elizabeth:** No, my Lord, how should I believe that? I say that Christ is the only priest through whom sins are forgiven.

**Official:** So far we have treated you gently. Since you won’t confess, we will put you to torture. Take hold of her.

Components of document analysis may include the following:

* Audience: The original information appears to be a simple documentation of the proceedings against Dirks; however, the pamphlet published with this story was a piece of propaganda for the Protestant cause.
* Purpose: The pamphlet was intended to inspire Protestants with examples of martyrs for their faith.
* Historical context: In the early stages of the Protestant Reformation it was illegal in most realms to profess views contrary to the teachings of the Catholic Church; and Anabaptists such as Dirks lacked the protection of great nobles attached to other Protestant groups.
* Author’s point of view: The unnamed author is presenting Dirks as a heroic dissenter protecting her coreligionist brethren and being true to her faith in the face of torture and death.

**Document 2**

Source: Ignatius of Loyola, founder of the Jesuits, from his *The Spiritual Exercises*, 1535

Eleventh Rule. To praise positive and scholastic learning. Because, as it is more proper to the Positive Doctors, as St. Jerome, St. Augustine and St. Gregory, etc., to move the heart to love and serve God our Lord in everything; so it is more proper to the Scholastics, as St. Thomas, St. Bonaventure, and to the Master of the Sentences, etc., to define or explain for our times the things necessary for eternal salvation; and to combat and explain better all errors and all fallacies. For the Scholastic Doctors, as they are more modern, not only help themselves with the true understanding of the Sacred Scripture and of the Positive and holy Doctors, but also, they being enlightened and clarified by the Divine virtue, help themselves by the Councils, Canons and Constitutions of our holy Mother the Church.

Components of document analysis may include the following:

* Audience: intended for other Catholics, especially future Jesuits
* Purpose: intended to inspire and instruct other Catholics and to provide guidelines for Jesuits
* Historical context: Written in the wake of Luther’s challenges to Catholic doctrine, Loyola’s *Exercises* attempted to provide direction and inspiration for the Catholic faithful and became the cornerstone of the Catholic Reformation.
* Author’s point of view: In this excerpt, Loyola spelled out the appropriateness and authoritativeness of official Church doctrine and the Doctors of the Church as the source for answers in religious matters.

**Document 3**

Source: Papal Bull that comes before and accompanies The Index of Prohibited Books in 1564

RULES

I. All books condemned by the supreme pontiffs, or general councils, before the year 1515, and not comprised in the present Index, are, nevertheless, to be considered as condemned.

II. The books of heresiarchs, whether of those who broached or disseminated their heresies prior to the year above-mentioned, or of those who have been, or are, the heads or leaders of heretics, as Luther, Zwingle, Calvin, Balthasar Pacimontanus, Swenchfeld, and other similar ones, are altogether forbidden, whatever may be their names, titles, or subjects. And the books of other heretics, which treat professedly upon religion, are totally condemned; . . . .

VII. . . . But the works of antiquity, written by the heathens, are permitted to be read, because of the elegance and propriety of the language; though on no account shall they be suffered to be read by young persons. . . .

X. . . . Finally, it is enjoined on all the faithful, that no one presume to keep or read any books contrary to these rules, or prohibited by this Index. But if any one read or keep any books composed by heretics, or the writings of any author suspected of heresy, or false doctrine, he shall instantly incur the sentence of excommunication; and those who read, or keep works interdicted on another account, besides the mortal sin committed, shall be severely punished at the will of the bishops.

Components of document analysis may include the following:

* Audience: intended for all Catholics at the time and, arguably, going forward
* Purpose: This Papal Bull spelled out the authority of the Index of Prohibited Books as a guide to those materials which should not be read so as to avoid being corrupted by heretical ideas.
* Historical context: In the wake of the Protestant Reformation, the Catholic Church sought to limit the exposure of its members to material that would lead them from following the teachings of the Church.
* Author’s point of view: The Pope declared that all Catholics should abide by the Index of Forbidden books and included all works condemned by the Popes or Councils and all writings by Protestant leaders that contradicted Church doctrine, even if not specifically on the list; however, it did exempt classical works.

**Document 4**

Source: Decrees of the Council of Trent, 1564, from the Decree Concerning Purgatory. The Council of Trent met from 1545 to 1563.

Whereas the Catholic Church, instructed by the Holy Ghost, has, from the sacred writings and the ancient tradition of the Fathers, taught, in sacred councils, and very recently the oecumenical [ecumenical] Synod\*, that there is a Purgatory, and that the souls there detained are helped by the suffrages^ of the faithful, but principally by the acceptable sacrifice of the altar; the holy Synod enjoins on bishops that they diligently endeavor that the sound doctrine concerning Purgatory, transmitted by the holy Fathers and sacred councils, be believed, maintained, taught, and everywhere proclaimed by the faithful of Christ. But let more difficult and subtly questions, and which tend not to edification, and from which for the most part there is no increase of piety, be excluded from popular discourses before the uneducated multitude. In like manner, such things as are uncertain, or which labor under an appearance of error, let them not allow to be made public and treated of. While those things which tend to a certain kind of curiosity or superstition, or which savour filthy lucre, let them prohibit as scandals and stumbling blocks of the faithful. But let the bishops take care, that the suffrages of the faithful who are living, to wit the sacrifices of masses, prayers, alms, and other works of piety, which have been wont to be performed by the faithful for the other faithful departed, be piously and devoutly performed, in accordance with the institutes of the church; and that whatsoever is due on their behalf, from the endowments of testators, or in other way, be discharged, not in a perfunctory manner, but diligently and accurately, by the priests and ministers of the church, and others who are bound to render this (service).

Note: \*The ecumenical Synod refers to the churchwide meetings at Trent; ^suffrages are prayers

Components of document analysis may include the following:

* Audience: intended primarily for the bishops and priests of the Catholic Church as a clarification on matters of doctrine but also for Catholics in general
* Purpose: to clarify issues of doctrine such as this case regarding the concept of Purgatory
* Historical context: written to summarize the decisions of the Council of Trent which was called to address and clarify issues of doctrine raised by the Protestant Reformation
* Author’s point of view: The Bishops at Trent called for the bishops and priests of the Church to present doctrine to the faithful as spelled out by the Council and to leave issues of debate to the Council. The document also carried an injunction to clergy to carry out their duties diligently, timely, and accurately.

**Document 5**

Source: Teresa of Avila, Epilogue to *The Interior Castle*, her treatise on prayer, 1588

In return for my strong desire to aid you in serving Him, my God and my Lord, I implore you, whenever you read this, to praise His Majesty fervently in my name and to be Him to prosper His Church to give light to the Lutherans, to pardon my sins and to free me from purgatory, where perhaps I shall be, by the mercy of God, when you see this book (if it is given to you after having been examined by theologians). If these writings contain any error, it is through my ignorance; I submit in all things to the teachings of the holy Catholic Roman Church, of which I am now a member, as I protest and promise I will be both in life and death.

Components of document analysis may include the following:

* Audience: intended as a spiritual guide for Catholics
* Purpose: Teresa attempted to explain her concepts of prayer as a means to achieve union with God. Through this concept, she sought to aid others in reaching the relationship with God that she professed was possible through prayer.
* Historical context: Written in the latter stages of the Catholic Reformation, Teresa of Avila’s works provided a spiritual, mystical approach to Catholicism that many felt the Catholic Church lacked but many Protestant faiths provided.
* Author’s point of view: Teresa spells out her belief in prayer as key to salvation and unity with God, but defers to the Church and theologians on matters of doctrine.

**Analysis of outside examples to support thesis/argument**

Possible examples of information not found in the documents that could be used to support the stated thesis or a relevant argument could include the following:

* Examples of Catholic Reformation success
	+ The Society of Jesus (Jesuits) managed to combat the spread of Protestantism to new areas and even turn back the growth of Protestantism in some areas such as Poland and Austria. Additionally, Jesuits and other missionaries spread Catholicism throughout the New World territories of Spain and France.
	+ The efforts of reforming popes, such as Paul III, spurred changes and rationalizing in Church doctrine and policy.
	+ The revived Inquisition, particularly in Rome and Spain, stamped out Protestantism and heresy.
	+ A new ecstatic mysticism as epitomized by Ignatius Loyola and Teresa of Avila invigorated the Catholic Church.
	+ The Council of Trent revised and issued authoritative doctrine that unified the Church, and issued decrees requiring increased accountability and training for priests and bishops.
	+ The continued growth of artistic and musical movements, such as baroque, to glorify Catholic churches, showed the renewed vitality of the Catholic Church in Europe.
* Examples of the failure of the Catholic Reformation
	+ The continued survival and spread of Lutheranism showed the inability of the Catholic Church to contain the Protestant reform movement.
	+ The emergence of additional reform movements such as those led by Calvin, Zwingli, or Henry VIII in addition to the persistence of smaller splinter groups such as Anabaptists illustrated a continued displeasure with Catholic dogma.
	+ The success of establishing various Protestant faiths as the official religion in places such as England, Scotland, Sweden, Denmark, and states of northern Germany gave the Protestant movement permanence which the Catholic Church and Catholic secular rulers were never able to turn back.

**Contextualization**

Students can earn a point for contextualization by accurately and explicitly connecting historical phenomena relevant to the argument to broader historical events and/or processes. These historical phenomena may include, but are not limited to, the following:

* The growth of Protestant religions throughout Europe accompanied the move toward more unified nation-states with powerful monarchies that sought to consolidate control under their own auspices.
* The Reformation, both Protestant and Catholic, was in many ways a result of the revival of rationalism and inquiry that grew out of the Renaissance interest in ancient society and philosophy.

**Synthesis**

Students can earn the point for synthesis by crafting a persuasive and coherent essay. This can be accomplished by providing a conclusion that extends or modifies the analysis in the essay, by using disparate and sometimes contradictory evidence from primary and/or secondary sources to craft a coherent argument, or by connecting to another historical period or context. Examples could include, but are not limited to, the following:

* The Reformation and Scientific Revolution can be linked to the modern growth of atheism and agnosticism as a continuation to the challenge against traditional religious authority.